STUDIES ON FRATERNITY: POINTERS ON THE WORK DONE DURING THIS PAST DECADE



This article mentions some academic events of the past decade and some relevant publications on the topic of fraternity, with the goal of offering a direction in preparation for the appointment on the 11-13 of March, 2013, «Fraternity as Relational Principle, in Law and Politics»; Sophia University Institute, Loppiano (Florence).

di
ANTONIO MARIA BAGGIO

We would like to mention some academic events of the past decade and some relevant publications on the topic of fraternity, with the goal of offering a direction in preparation for the appointment on the 11-13 of March, 2013, «Fraternity as Relational Principle, in Law and Politics»; Sophia University Institute, Loppiano (Florence).

In these past years interest in fraternity has been greatly increasing, not intended as a parental relationship lived in private, and neither as a privileged relationship within a closed organization , religious or sectarian, but as a relational principle of thought and action which finds its realization and development in the public sphere. Fraternity is certainly not a recent discovery; it has a long and plural history, because the idea of fraternity, in its diverse versions, belongs to civilizations that arose in all continents and which left many and important traces in today's cultures.

Beyond the fraternity brought about by traditions, studies need to look also at fraternity lived on a daily basis, which gives life to infinite and various forms of social relations, of economic and political cooperation, of voluntary commitment. Experiences of fraternity have characterized important pivotal points in history such as the transitions from dictatorial-authoritarian regimes to democratic systems (The Philippines after Marcos, South Africa after Apartheid), or the make-up of conflicts which risked becoming permanent (Northern Ireland, Mozambique). These are only a few examples of "case studies" where the analysis brings into evidence the relevance of fraternity, its cultural and social presence, its public role.

What was missing up until a few years ago was an adequate awareness of its presence. In the absence of a *thought on fraternity*, there was also an inability to recognize it and to understand its historical, cultural, and social role; one could sense, instead, the difficulties connected with the ambivalence of the term, and the interpretations at times reciprocally exclusive or ideological. The situation today has changed, thanks to the progressive interest which fraternity has gained in the academic world through prominent publicized works, which put fraternity at the centre of interest.

The difficulties which existed for the scholar, at least a decade ago, who started to occupy himself with fraternity, were rather relevant: the term itself was not in philosophical dictionaries, nor in those of political science, of law and of sociology. The study on fraternity in its public dimension did not belong to any academic tradition, or in any other known discipline.

France was the exception, where fraternity had become interwoven, through the 'triptych' of 1789, with the history of the Republic. There were academic works of great value regarding the history of public law. We point out in particular, in the field of historical-cultural reconstruction, the works of Michel Borgetto (1993 and 1997), Marcel David (1987 and 1992), Mona Ozouf (1988 and 1989); important theoretical reflections were proposed by Maurice Blanchot (1983), Guy Lafon (1987) Jean-Luc Nancy (1993), Jacques Derrida (1993), Nicole Loraux (1997), Marie de Solemne (1998), Catherine Charlier (2003). In France,

in fact, there remains a latent cultural openness towards fraternity which permits one to begin a discussion without having to justify oneself (for example, as exemplified by the not so strictly academic works, aimed at a vast public, by J. Attali (1999) B. Mattéi (2003), H. Herbreteau (2009), R. Debray (2009). We point to the recent publication, edited by Bertrand G., Brice C., Montegre G., of the collective volume *Fraternité*. *Pour une histoire du concept* (2012). Naturally, the complexity of French and European history will continue to supply material for study, also because it extends beyond a European dimension, and it takes in others Continents, as the Americas and Africa, as shown by the recent rereading of the thoughts of Toussaint Louverture, as provided through the publishing of his epistolary with Laveaux (Baggio and Augustin 2011): from the letters emerge a new prospective of the relationship between the Parisian Revolution and the one fought by the slaves of Saint-Domingue (now Haiti), in which fraternity, banished in France, acquires a constructive role in the new nation of ex-slaves, the first Black Republic.

This "Atlantic" dimension of fraternity has prompted the organization of research projects which connect European and American scholars. Such collaboration was first expressed in three international seminars: at Port-au-Prince, Haiti (Politique et economie: les voies de la fraternite`, March 13, 2002, with these participating universities: Columbia of New York, the Gregorian of Rome, University of Haiti); at Cobo (Mar del Plata, B. A., Symposium on Epistemology of Sciences, organized by CIAFIC – Research Center in Philosophical and Cultural Anthropology – associated with the National Council for Research of Argentina, on August 4, 2003, the acts of which were published the following year (Archideo 2004); and at O'Higgins, B.A., Argentina (Continental American Seminar between University Professors, organized by the Tony Weber Foundation, on: The Principle of Fraternity, on July 27-28, 2003, with 24 professors participating from South America (see www.fondazioneweber.org).

In Italy – in addition to the studies realised on the occasion of the Bicentenary of the 1789's French Revolution, among which we mention Martinelli A., Salvati M., Veca S. (1988) and M. R. Manieri (1989) - we point to a few pioneering works: the collective volume regarding political symbols studies, edited by Giulio M. Chiodi, *La contesa tra fratelli* (Chiodi 1992), *Esistenza e gratuità*, with a chapter on "Politics and Fraternity" of Roberto Mancini (Mancini 1996); *Appunti sul principio di fraternità nell'ordinamento giuridico italiano* of Filippo Pizzolato (2011), *Il diritto fraterno* of Eligio Resta (2002), *Politiques de Caïn*, collective volume written in French language by a team of Italian researchers of the University of Messina (Mazzù 2004). An inter-university study seminar on "Principle of Fraternity and Political Reflection" was held in Rome, at the Pontifical Gregorian University, on July 5, 2003; followed by a semester course, held at the same university within the study plan of the Faculty of Philosophy in the academic year 2003-2004, taught by a group of professors from 9 Italian Universities: it was the first interdisciplinary academic course dedicated explicitly to the principle of fraternity.

Two related volumes were published in 2007: *Fraternity as Principle of Public Law*, edited by Anna Marzanati and Angelo Mattioni (Mattioni – Marzanati 2007) and *The Forgotten Principle*: *Fraternity in a Contemporary Political Science*

Reflection (Baggio 2007). *The Forgotten Principle* had already been published the previous year in Argentina. The text underwent an academic evaluation by three Universities of Cordoba (the National University, the Catholic University, the Blaise Pascal University) which, during the "Inter-university Day" celebrated in Cordoba` on April 16, 2007, declared that the topic of fraternity, as it was treated in the book, constituted a 'discussion of academic interest,' opening the possibility of organizing courses, research projects and thesis on this subject. The volume will be translated, enriched by the contribution of American scholars, in Portuguese, in two volumes (Baggio 2008 and 2009). Contemporaneously, the National University of La Plata (Argentina) established the chair dedicated to a "Society, Politics and Fraternity" (April 18, 2007). Another chair was created by the Pontifical Catholic University of Santiago, Chile, in 2011.

The year 2008 saw the birth of RUEF (Universitary Net for the Study of Fraternity, see *www.ruef.net.br*), an international initiative of academic dialogue which promotes the study and research around fraternity in its public dimension, in the humane and social sciences. From 2008, the RUEF organized an international academic seminar regarding fraternity, which from year to year is seeing the participation of predominantly Latin-American scholars, and in the last few years, also European (Córdoba 2008, La Plata 2009, Tucumán 2010, Santiago, Chile 2011, Recife 2012). The RUEF is an important reality which characterizes the Latin-American approach to studies of fraternity: a real and true academic study community free and open to all, was created. The results are not lacking; we point to – in Castilian language – the collective volumes edited by Baggio (2009a), Barreneche (2010), Ramirez Rivas (2011), Veronese and Boschi (2011), Muniz Lopez (2012) and the monograph of Domingo Ighina (2012).

In Brazil we point to the work of Carlos Ayres Britto (2003), Ana Maria de Barros (2006), the collective volume *Direito e Fraternidade* (2008); the most recent works are *Direitos na pós-modernidade: a fraternidade em questão*, edited by Josiane Petry Veronese and Olga Boschi Aguiar de Oliveira (2011), *A Fraternidade em debate: percurso de estudos na América Latina*, edited by Paulo Muniz Lopes (2012). We point also to the article of Carlos Augusto Alcantara Machado (2010), with extensive bibliography, available online.

The Italian work has also been notably enriched. In his book of 2007 Mario Vergani writes a significant chapter on "Fraternity and difference" (Vergani 2007). We point to the works of A. Cosseddu (2008, 2009, 2012), R. Roche-Olivar, Catalan professor who elaborated a study about the relation between the pro-social psychological theory and political fraternity (2009), M. Martino (2010), G. Tosi (2010), P. Giusta (2012) (partially available online: *www.nuovaumanita.cittanuova.it*). Of note, the collective volume edited by Daniela Ropelato, *Democrazia intelligente. La partecipazione: attori e processi* (2010), the monographs of Iliana Massa Pinto on *Costituzione e fraternità* ((2011) and of Filippo Pizzolato on *Il principio costituzionale di fraternità* (2012). Again, we point to the collective volume *Caino e i suoi fratelli. Il fondamento relazione nella politica e nel diritto* (Baggio 2012).

In Spain, after the work of Gurutz Jáuregui (2004) and the very ideological book of Antoni Doménech (2004), we point to the collective volume edited by Antonio Márquez Prieto, *Fraternidad y Justicia* (2012).

Cited Bibliography

C.A. Alcantara Machado, *A fraternidade come categoria constitucional*, in http://*www.ruef.net.br/uploads/biblioteca/cbadd4bddf309fcd6d0dafd986e35076.pdf*, 2010

L.B. Archideo (ed.), *Epistemologia de las Ciencias Sociales. La fraternidad,* CIAFIC ediciones, Centro de Investigaciones en Antropología Filosófica y Cultural, Buenos Aires 2004.

J. Attali, *Fraternitées. Une nouvelle utopie*, Fayard, Paris 1999.

A.M. Baggio (a cura di), *Il principio dimenticato. La fraternità nella riflessione politologica contemporanea*, Città Nuova, Roma 2007 [Ed. argentina: *El principio olvidado: la fraternidad. En la Politica y el Derecho* (ed.), Ciudad Nueva, Buenos Aires 2006].

Id., *O princípio esquecido/1. A fraternidade na reflexão actual das ciências políticas*, Cidade Nova, São Paulo 2008.

Id., *O princípio esquecido/2. Exigências, recursos e definições da fraternidade na política*, Cidade Nova, São Paulo 2009.

Id. (comp.), *La fraternidad en perspectiva política. Exigencias, recursos, definiciones del principio olvidado*, Ciudad Nueva, Buenos Aires 2009.

Id. – R. Augustin (edd.), *Toussaint Louverture, Lettres à la France (1794-1798). Idées pour la libération du Peuple noir d'Haïti*, Introduction et appareil critique d'Antonio Maria Baggio et Ricardo Augustin, Nouvelle Cité, Paris 2009.

Id. (con A. Cosseddu, P. Giusta, R. Mardones, A. Márquez Prieto), *Caino e i suoi fratelli. Il fondamento relazionale nella politica e nel diritto*, Città Nuova, Roma 2012.

O. Barreneche (comp.), *Estudios recientes sobre fraternidad. Da la enunciación como principio a la consolidación como perspectiva*, Ciudad Nueva, Buenos Aires 2010.

G. Bertrand – C. Brice, G. Montègre (dir.), *Fraternité. Pour une histoire du concept*, Les Cahiers du CRHIPA n. 20, Grenoble 2012.

M. Blanchot, *La communauté inavouable*, Minuit, Paris 1983.

M. Borgetto, *La notion de fraternité en droit public français. Le passé, le présent et l'avenir de la solidarité,* Librairie Générale de Droit et de Jurisprudence, Paris 1993.

Id., *La devise «Liberté, Égalité, Fraternité»,* Presses Universitaires de France, Paris 1997.

C.A. Britto, *Teoria da Constituição*, Editoria Forense, Rio de Janeiro 2003.

G. Caso – A. Cury – M. Cury – C.A. Mota de Souza, *Direito e Fraternidade*, Comunhão e Direito, LTr, Cidade Nova, São Paulo 2008.

G.M. Chiodi (a cura di), *La contesa tra fratelli*, Giappichelli, Torino 1992.

A. Cosseddu, *L'oggi del diritto: tramonto o «nuovi» albori?* in «Nuova Umanità», XXX (2008/4-5), pp. 461-476.

Id., *Comunione:* «spazio condiviso» per un dialogo possibile tra economia e diritto, in «Nuova Umanità», XXXI (2009/6), pp. 757-782.

M. David, *Fraternité et Révolution française*, Aubier, Paris 1987.

Id., *Le primptemps de la fraternité. Genèse et vicissitudes 1830-1851*, Aubier, Paris 1992.

A. M. De Barros, *Fraternidade, politica e direitos humanos*, in «Rivista da Faculdade de Direito de Caruaru», 2006 (37/01), Idéia, João Pessoa, pp. 53-72.

J. Derrida, *Politiques de l'amitié*, Galilée, Paris 1993.

M. De Solemne (ed.), *Insaisissable fraternité*, Dervy, Paris 1998.

R. Debray, *Le moment fraternité*, Gallimard, Paris 2009.

A. Domènech, *El eclipse de la fraternidad. Una revisión repubblicana de la tradición socialista*, Crítica, Barcelona 2004.

H. Herbreteau, *La fraternitè. Entre utopie et* réalité, Les Éditions de l'Atelier/Les Éditions Ouvrières, Paris 2009.

D. Ighina, *La brasa bajo la ceniza. La Fraternidad en el pensamiento de la integración latinoamericana. Un recorrido*, Ciudad Nueva, Buenos Aires 2012.

G. Jáuregui, *La democracia en el siglo XXI: un nuevo mundo, unos nuevos valores*, Istituto Vasco de Administración Pública, Oñati 2004.

N. Loraux, *La cité divisée*, Payot, Paris 1997.

R. Mancini, *Esistenza e gratuità. Antropologia della condivisione*, Cittadella, Assisi 1996.

M.R. Manieri, *E. Kant: dalla fraternità alla giustizia*, in «Bollettino di Storia della filosofia dell'Università degli Studi di Lecce», a cura di G. Papuli, 1986/89, vol. IX (1989), pp. 49-78.
A. Márquez Prieto, *Fraternidad y Justicia*, Editorial Comares, Granada 2012.
A. Martinelli – M. Salvati – S. Veca, *Progetto 89. Tre saggi su libertà, eguaglianza, fraternità*, Il Saggiatore, Milano 1988.
M. Martino, *La prospettiva della fraternità nel pensiero di John Rawls*, in «Nuova Umanità», XXXII (2010/4-5), pp. 549-566.
I. Massa Pinto, *Costituzione e fraternità. Una teoria della fraternità conflittuale: "come se" fossimo fratelli*, Jovene, Napoli 2011.
B. Mattéi, *La fraternité, est-ce possibile?*, Louis Audibert Editions, Paris 2003.
A. Mattioni – A. Marzanati (a cura di), *La fraternità come principio del diritto pubblico*, Città Nuova, Roma 2007.
D. Mazzù, *Politiques de Caïn. En dialogue avec René Girard*, Desclée de Brower, Paris 2004.
P. Muniz Lopes, *A Fraternidade em debate: percurso de estudos na América Latina*, Cidade Nova, São Paulo 2012.
J.-L. Nancy, *Le sens du monde*, Galilée, Paris 1993.
M. Ozouf, *Fraternité*, in F. Furet – M. Ozouf, «Dictionnaire critique de la Révolution Française», Flammarion, Paris 1988, pp. 731-740.
Id., *L'homme régénéré*, Paris 1989 (in particolare le pp. 11-16 e il capitolo: *La Révolution française et l'idée de fraternité*).
J.R. Petry Veronese – O.M. Boschi Aguiar de Oliveira (orgg.), *Direitos na pós-modernidade: a fraternidade em questão*, Funjab, Florianopolis/SC (Brazil) 2011.
F. Pizzolato, *Appunti sul principio di fraternità nell'ordinamento giuridico italiano*, in «Rivista internazionale dei diritti dell'uomo», 2001, pp. 745-806 (ora in Id., 2012).
Id., *Il principio costituzionale di fraternità. Itinerario di ricerca a partire dalla Costituzione italiana*, Città Nuova, Roma 2012.
P. Ramírez Rivas, *Fraternidad y conflicto. Enfoques, debates y perspectivas*, Ciudad Nueva, Buenos Aires 2011.
E. Resta, *Il diritto fraterno*, Laterza, Roma-Bari 2002.
D. Ropelato (a cura di), *Democrazia intelligente. La partecipazione: attori e processi*, Città Nuova, Roma 2010.
G. Tosi, *La fraternità come categoria (cosmo)politica*, in «Nuova Umanità», XXXII (2010/4-5), pp. 525-547.
M. Vergani, *Dal soggetto al nome proprio. Fenomenologia della condizione umana tra etica e politica*, Bruno Mondadori, Milano 2007, pp. 161-197.

ANTONIO MARIA BAGGIO
Professore di Filosofia politica presso l'Istituto Universitario Sophia
antoniomaria.baggio@iu-sophia.org